



### **OPERATIONS COMMITTEE SEPTEMBER 18, 2003**

SUBJECT:

RAIL WINDOW VANDAL PROTECTION SHIELDS

Los Angeles County Metropolitan

**ACTION:** 

AWARD CONTRACT FOR RAIL WINDOW VANDAL

PROTECTION SHIELDS

Transportation Authority

### RECOMMENDATION

One Gateway Plaza Los Angeles, CA

90012

Authorize the Chief Executive Officer to award a 24-month, firm fixed price contract under Bid 03-0008 to Graffiti Removal Inc., the lowest responsive, responsible bidder for Rail Window Vandal Protection Shields for an amount not to exceed \$252,146, inclusive of sales tax.

213.922.6000

### **RATIONALE**

Vandal shields protect the windows from graffiti markings and vandalism, thus avoiding permanent damage to the windows as well as reducing parts and labor costs. These vandal sheets are required to maintain the appearance of the rail cars and are replaced as necessary. Replacement of the vandal shields is in compliance with our Zero Tolerance program.

The vandal shields have been adapted to conform to specific requirements for each of the rail line cars in terms of the type of material, adhesive, dimensions and application process.

### **FINANCIAL IMPACT**

Funding of \$126,073 for these vandal shields will be included in the FY04 budget and subsequent budgets in Cost Center Number 3940, Line item 50441, M&S Parts, Revenue Vehicle, Task 5.2, Rail Equipment Maintenance under Project 300022, Metro Blue Line Purchase Parts, Project 300033 Metro Green Line Purchase Parts, Project Number 300055, Metro Gold Line purchase parts and 300044, Metro Red Line purchase parts. Since this is a multi-year contract, the cost center manager and Deputy Chief Executive Officer will be accountable for budgeting the cost in future years. In FY02, \$175,134 was expended on this category.

## **ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED**

The alternative is not to award the contract and continue to procure vandal shields on an asneeded basis at a higher cost. This approach is not recommended since it does not provide for a firm fixed price or a commitment from the supplier to ensure availability.

# **ATTACHMENTS**

A Procurement Summary A-1 Procurement History A-2 List of Subcontractors A-3 Bid Tabulation

Prepared By: Juelene Close, Buyer

Paul Lewicki, Inventory Control Manager

John B. Catoe, Jr.
Deputy Chief Executive Officer

Roger Snoble // Chief Executive Officer

# ATTACHMENT A PROCUREMENT SUMMARY

# **RAIL WINDOW VANDAL PROTECTION SHIELDS**

1.	Contract Number: 03-0008									
2.	Recommended Vendor:									
	Graffiti Removal Inc., PO Box 2991, La Habra, CA									
3.	Cont/Price Analysis Information									
3.	Cost/Price Analysis Information:  A. Bid/Proposed Price: Estimated Amount:									
	\$252,146	\$269,141	nount:							
			<del></del>							
4.	B. Details of Significant Variances are in	Attachment A-1.1	<u>)                                    </u>							
5.	Contract Type: Fixed Price Procurement Dates:			- Andrews of the Anna and the A						
3.	A. Issued: 10/02/02									
	B. Advertised: 9/24/02									
	C. Pre-bid Conference: 10/11/02									
	D. Proposals/Bids Due: 11/15/02			er - Inante Principal Control						
	E. Pre-Qualification Completed: Yes									
	F. Conflict of Interest Form Submitted to	Ethics: Vec	····							
6.	Small Business Participation:	Lines, 10s	·							
0.	A. Bid/Proposal Goal: 0%	Date Small Rusin	ece Fy	aluation Completed:						
	71. Dia roposar Goat. 676	Date Small Business Evaluation Completed: N/A								
	Small Business Commitment: No goal recommended									
7.	Invitation for Bid/Request for Proposal I									
	1 ^	osals Picked up:	Bids/l	Proposals Received:						
	21	21	L	7						
8.	Evaluation Information:									
	A. Proposers Names:	Bid/Proposal Am	Best and Final Offer							
	1. Orange County Industrial Plastics	\$ 187,455	Amount: N/A							
	2. CP Films	\$ 202,730								
	3. Graffiti Removal	\$ 252,146								
	4. West Coast Gasket	\$ 285,804								
	5. 3M Center	\$ 299,101								
	6. Laird Plastics 7. J. T. Nelson	\$ 259,154 \$1,123,428								
	/. J. I. Neison	\$1,133,428								
	B. Evaluation Methodology: Selection of	f the lowest respon	nsive, r	esponsible bidder.						
9.	Protest Information:		**************							
	A. Protest Period End Date: 9-26-03									
	B. Protest Receipt Date: TBD									
	C. Disposition of Protest Date: TBD									
10.	Contract Administrator: Juelene Close	Telephone Num	ber: 2-	1066						
11.	Project Manager: Paul Lewicki Telephone Number: 2-5743									

# ATTACHMENT A-1 PROCUREMENT HISTORY

## A. Background on Contractor

Graffiti Removal Inc., was founded in 1976 and is located in Huntington Beach, CA. Graffiti Removal, Inc. operates as a retailer/wholesaler of pre shielding protective for glass, primarily used to prevent graffiti. They also provide contracting services specializing in graffiti removal.

Graffiti Removal Inc. has provided satisfactory service and products to the MTA.

### B. Procurement Background

In accordance with the MTA's Procurement Policies and Procedures, Engineering Department performed a technical evaluation of seven bids that were received. The two apparent lowest bidders were determined to be non-responsive to the specifications.

### C. Evaluation Criteria

Technical review and selection of the lowest responsive, responsible bidder.

- Orange County Industrial Plastics in the amount of \$187,455 did not comply with the technical and the bid specifications. Test results and related documents were not submitted in a timely manner.
   Bidder #2 CP Films in the amount of \$202,730 did not comply with the technical and bid specifications. Test results and related documents were not submitted in a timely manner.
   Bidder #3 Graffiti Removal in the amount of \$252,145 was in full compliance with the technical and the bid specifications.
- Bidder #4 West Coast Gasket in the amount of \$285,804 was in full compliance with the technical and the bid specifications; however, they were not the low bidder on this item.
- Bidder #5 3M Center in the amount of \$299,101 was in full compliance with the technical and the bid specifications; however, they were not the low bidder on this item.

- Bidder #6 Laird Plastics in the amount of \$259,154 is in full compliance with the technical and the bid specifications; however, they were not the low bidder on this item.
- Bidder #7 J.T. Nelson in the amount of \$1,133,428 is in full compliance with the technical and the bid specifications; however, they were not the low bidder on this item.

### D. <u>Cost/Price Analysis Explanation of Variances</u>

The recommended bid price of \$252,146 has been determined to be fair and reasonable based upon adequate price competition and selection of the lowest responsive and responsible bidder.

# ATTACHMENT A-2 LIST OF SUBCONTRACTORS

# RAIL WINDOW VANDAL PROTECTION SHIELDS

**PRIME CONTRACTOR** - Graffiti Removal, Inc.

**Small Business Commitment** 

No goal recommended

**Total Commitment** 

### œ

# LOS ANGELES COUNTY METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY BID TABULATION BID NO: 030008 RAIL WINDOW VANDAL PROTECTION SHIELDS ATTACHMENT A-3

J. T Nelson Co.		Unit Extension Price	313.32 \$6,660.00	335.34 \$88,350.00	\$93,000.00 \$57.08 \$285,400.00		544.30 \$11,075.00	\$396,010.00	\$32,670.83	\$428,680.83
Laird Plastics		Extension	\$2,455.00 \$13.32	\$21,850.00 \$35.34			\$2,237.50 \$44.30	\$121,017.50	\$9,983.94	\$131,001.44
		Unit Price	\$4.91	\$8.74	\$18.60	\$5.90	\$8.95			
3M Center		Extension	\$4,330.00	\$22,325.00	\$72,000.00	\$2,492.50	\$4,720.00	\$105,867.50	\$8,734.07	\$114,601.57
3M		Unit Price	\$8.66	\$8.93	\$14.40	\$9.97	\$18.88			
West Coast Gasket Co.		Extension	\$2,350.00	\$13,750.00	\$84,500.00 \$14.40	\$1,175.00	\$2,875.00 \$18.88	\$104,650.00	\$8,633.63	\$113,283.63
≱రో		Unit Price	\$4.70	\$5.50	\$16.90	\$4.70	\$11.50			
Graffiti Removal, Inc.		Extension	\$1,810.00	\$17,250.00	\$77,700.00 \$16.90	\$1,230.00	\$3,015.00 \$11.50	\$101,005.00	\$8,332.91	\$109,337.91
0 %		Unit Price	\$3.62	\$6.90	\$15.54	\$4.92	\$12.06			
CP Films		Extension	\$5,080.00	\$10.16 \$25,400.00	\$10.16 \$50,800.00 \$15.54		\$2,540.00 \$12.06	\$86,360.00	\$7,124.70	\$93,484.70
		Crit Price	\$10.16	\$10.16	\$10.16	\$10.16	\$10.16			
Orange County Industrial Plastics		Extension	\$1,290.00	\$9,775.00	\$7.88 \$39,400.00		\$2,887.50	\$54,225.00	\$4,473.56	\$58,698.56
		Unit Price	\$2.58	\$3.91	\$7.88	\$3.49	\$11.55			
<u>e</u>		24 MO Total Usage	500	2,500	5,000	250	250	Sub Total	8.25%	Total Bid
Bids Out: 09/27/02 Total 23 Bids Opened: 11/15/02 Total No Bids: Advertisement Date(s): 09/26/02 Newspaper: Daily News, Wave and Eastern Group	Date(s): 09/26/02 uily News, Wave and Eastern Grou Blue Line	Description	SHIELD - VANDAL PASSENGER, WINDOW, UPPER – 47,250" x 6.313"			A911700391 SHIELD - VANDAL, CAB, DOOR, WINDOW 27.063" × 14.938"	SHIELD – VANDAL, CAB PARTITION, WINDOW 31.875" x 31.125"	ns N	Sales Tax 8.25%	
Bids Out: 09/27/02 Total Bids Opened: 11/15/02 Total No Bids: Advertisement Date(s): 09/26/02 Newspaper: Daily News, Wave a	ã	MTA No.	A911700388	A911700389	A911700390	A911700391	A911700392			
, m, m, r., 4, r.,		≗ε	_	2	က	4	လ			

J. T. Nelson Co.	Extension	\$199,400.0	\$2,160.0	\$1,511.0	\$2,572.0	\$9,590.4	\$2,192.0	\$5,940.0i	\$3,810.0	\$1,905.00	\$229,080.4	\$18,899.1:	\$247,979.5
L S	Unit Price	\$79.76	\$21.60	\$30.22	\$25.72	\$28.80	\$21.92	\$19.80	\$38.10	\$38.10	35	97	₩.
Laird Plastics	Extension	\$13.19 \$32,975.00	\$369.00	\$370.00	\$470.00	\$1,565.10	\$330.00	\$1,107.00 \$19.80	\$683.00	\$341.50	\$38,210.60	\$3,152.37	\$41,362.97
<u> </u>	Price Price		\$3.69	\$7.40	\$4.70	\$4.70	\$3.30	\$3.69	\$6.83	\$6.83			
3M Center	Extension	\$44,075.00	\$1,155.00	\$780.00	\$1,155.00	\$3,509.82	\$1,155.00	\$3,282.00	\$1,560.00	\$780.00	\$57,451.82	\$4,739.78	\$62,191.60
3M	Chit Price	\$17.63	\$11.55	\$15.60	\$11.55	\$10.54	\$11.55	\$10.94	\$15.60	\$15.60			
West Coast Gasket Co.	Extension	\$20.00 \$50,000.00 \$17.63	\$610.00 \$11.55	\$400.00	\$800.00	\$2,997.00	\$500.00	\$1,500.00 \$10.94	\$925.00	\$462.50	\$58,194.50	\$4,801.05	\$62,995.55
We Ga	Unit		\$6.10	\$8.00	\$8.00	\$9.00	\$5.00	\$5.00	\$9.25	\$9.25			
Graffiti Removal, Inc.	Extension	\$16.13 \$40,325.00	\$437.00	\$305.50	\$520.00	\$2,450.88	\$326.00	\$1,200.00	\$711.00	\$355.50	\$46,630.88	\$3,847.05	\$50,477.93
~ ~	Unit Price		\$4.37	\$6.11	\$5.20	\$7.36	\$3.26	\$4.00	\$7.11	\$7.11			
CP Films	Extension	\$25,400.00	\$1,016.00	\$508.00	\$1,016.00	\$3,383.28	\$1,016.00	\$3,048.00	\$1,016.00	\$508.00	\$36,911.28	\$3,045.18	\$39,956.46
	Unit Price	\$10.18	\$10.16	\$10.16	.00 \$10.16	\$10.16	\$10.16	00 \$10.16	\$10.16	\$10.16			
Orange County Industrial Plastics	Extension	\$13.41 \$33,525.00	\$432.00	\$337.50	\$620.00	\$2,214.45	\$368.00		\$770.00	\$385.00	\$39,914.95	\$3,292.98	\$43,207.93
O O PEI EE	Unit Price	\$13.41	\$4.32	\$6.75	\$6.20	\$6.65	\$3.68	\$4.21	\$7.70	\$7.70			
	24 MO Total Usage	2,500	100	50	100	333	100	300	100	20	Sub Total	Sales Tax 8.25%	Total Bid
Bids Out: 09/27/02 Total 23 Bids Opened: 11/15/02 Total No Bids: Advertisement Date(s): 09/26/02 Newspaper: Daily News, Wave and Eastern Group Red Line	Description	FILM - ANTI-GRAFFITI, SIDE WINDOWS (WXH) 55" X 32 1/2"			FILM - ANTI-GRAFFITI, END DOOR WINDOW (WXH) 18 X 32"	FILM – ANTI-GRAFFITI, H-4 WINDOW (WXH) 20" X 32 %"		FILM – ANTI-GRAFFITI, OPERATOR SLIDING WINDOW (WXH) 13 1/2" X 32 1/3"				Sales Ta	
Bids Out: 09/27/02 Total Bids Opened: 11/15/02 Total No Bids: Advertisement Date(s): 09/26/02 Newspaper: Daily News, Wave at Red Line	MTA No.	H910000017	H910000018	H910000019	H910000020	H910000021	H910000022	H910000023	H910000024	H910000025			
B B B B	Item	9	7	œ	6	10	Į.	12	13	4-			

	J. T Nelson Co.		Extensior	\$127.80 \$306,720.0	\$61,872.0	\$40,416.0	\$9,378.0	\$2,100.0	\$1,470.0	\$421,956.0	\$34,811.3	\$456,767.3
	Ž		Price Price	\$127.80	\$25.78	\$67.36	\$31.26	\$7.00	4.9			
	Laird Plastics		Extension	\$75,864.00 \$24.30 \$58,320.00	\$11,832.00	\$7,422.00	\$1,551.00	\$525.00	\$525.00	\$80,175.00	\$6,614.44	\$86,789.44
	ρ.,		Price	\$24.30	\$4.93	\$12.37	\$5.17	\$1.75	1.75			
	3M Center		Extension	\$75,864.00	\$21,840.00	\$6,096.00	\$4,287.00	\$2,424.00	\$2,475.00	\$112,986.00	\$9,321.35	\$122,307.35
	3M		Price Price	\$31.61	\$9.10	\$10.16	\$14.29	\$8.08	8.25			
	West Coast Gasket Co.		Extension	\$72,960.00 \$31.61	\$15,168.00	\$9,600.00 \$10.16	\$2,250.00 \$14.29	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$101,178.00	\$8,347.19	\$109,525.19
	S W		Price	\$30.40	\$6.32	\$16.00	\$7.50	\$2.00	\$2.00			
	Graffiti Removal, Inc.		Extension	\$25.84 \$62,016.00	\$12,504.00	\$8,154.00   \$16.00	\$1,896.00	\$426.00	\$297.00	\$85,293.00	\$7,036.67	\$92,329.67
			Unit Price		\$5.21	₩	6.32	1.42	0.99			
	CP Films		Extension		€9	\$6,096.00	\$3,048.00			\$64,008.00	\$5,280.66	\$69,288.66
			Price Price	\$10.16	\$10.16	\$10.16	\$10.16	\$10.16	00 \$10.16			
	Orange County Industrial Plastics		Extension	\$23.50 \$56,400.00	\$4.69 \$11,256.00	\$8,508.00	\$2,016.00   \$10.16	\$504.00	\$345.00	\$79,029.00	\$6,519.89	\$85,548.89
	— — — — — — — — — — — — — — — — — — —		Price Price		\$4.69	\$14.18	\$6.72	\$1.68	1.15			
	dno		24 MO Total Usage	2,400	2,400	009	300	300	300	Sub Total	IX 8.25%	Total Bid
7002 Total 23	7 09/2 S, W.S	Green/Gold Line	Description	SHIELD- VANDAL, PASSENGER WINDOW, LARGE, P2000 70 13/16 X40 7/16	N911700345 SHIELD - VANDAL, PASSENGEH DOOR WINDOW, P2000 43 5/8"X13 1/4	SHIELD- VANDAL, PASSENGER WINDOW, SMALL, P2000 40 5/16 X 37 7/16	N911700349 SHIELD - VANDAL, CAB, PARTITION WINDOW 34 7/16" X 20 5/16"	N911700346 SHIELD - VANDAL, CAB DOOR, WINDOW,LOWER,2000 17 9/16X8 15/16			Sales Tax 8.25%	
Rids Out: 09/27/02	Bids Opened: 11/15/02 No Bids: Advertisement Date(s): Newspaper: Daily New	ee.5	MTA No.	N911700348 SHIELD VANDAI WINDOI 70 13/16	N911700345	N911700350 SHIELD- VANDAL WINDOV 40 5/16 )	N911700349	N911700346	N911700347			
α	1 M Z Z Z		Item	35	9	17	<b>8</b> 2	61	8			