

**Metro**EXECUTIVE MANAGEMENT AND AUDIT COMMITTEE
JANUARY 20, 2005

SUBJECT: PROCUREMENT MANUAL

19

ACTION: APPROVE RECOMMENDATIONS

RECOMMENDATION

- A. Receive and file report of Procurement's comparative analysis of procurement manuals from other agencies and Sandia National Laboratories.
- B. Rewrite the Procurement manual.

ISSUE

As part of a recent review of Procurement operations, Steve Polan a consultant from Manatt Phelps & Phillips, LLP (Manatt), found that from a user perspective, the Procurement Manual remains "overly detailed and quite cumbersome". At the August 2004 Board meeting, Director Burke requested staff obtain procurement manuals from other jurisdictions and report back with an analysis of how they differ from our manual.

DISCUSSION

Staff obtained seven procurement manuals from various agencies and Sandia National Laboratories (Sandia) including three of the four transit properties surveyed in the Manatt report. The three include Massachusetts Bay Transportation Authority ("MBTA"), New Jersey Transit ("NJTransit"), and the Washington Metropolitan Transit Authority ("WMATA"). New York City Transit is currently rewriting its manual and was only able to send the Table of Contents, Index and a few chapters. New York is planning on following Federal Transit Administration Best Practices Manual when they rewrite their manual.

In addition, staff obtained the Dallas Area Rapid Transit ("DART") and the Bay Area Rapid Transit District ("BART") procurement manuals to get an additional perspective from other transit agencies with rail construction projects. We also received a copy of Los Angeles County's manuals. LA City is currently rewriting their manual and was only able to send some procurement procedures. Staff also reviewed Sandia's procurement manual based on the advice of Professor Ralph Nash, founder of Government Contracts Program at George Washington University School of Law.

Several of the manuals (WMATA, DART, and BART) are similar to our manual format and to the old Federal Acquisition Regulation (FAR). However, they do not incorporate many of the lessons of procurement reform adopted by the Federal government in 1994 and 1995 and subsequently by several state agencies.

These manuals were developed during the time when rules, objectification, and hierarchy in the system, were the standard. For example, each manual contains detailed procedures for handling the extremely rare occurrence of tie bids.

The NJTransit and MBTA manuals have been developed in the past two years, are more streamlined, and are written in a straightforward format and style. The NJTransit and MBTA manuals do a good job of providing a logical framework for the procurement process and the requirements are clearly and concisely covered.

Los Angeles County operates under different procurement rules and processes than LACMTA; it is subject to different state procurement laws and does not have to comply with Federal Transit Administration regulations. There was some good information in LA County's manuals including informal bidding caps (LACMTA's small purchases threshold) at \$100,000 and a performance monitoring system, which should be incorporated into our procurement manual contingent upon change to state law requirements.

Sandia's procurement manual is a much larger document in comparison with all the other manuals reviewed. The subjects are ordered in a chronological sequence mirroring the procurement process. Their procurement manual intermixes policy with procedure. The advantage of doing this is all procurement guidance is in one place, which precludes the need for separate desk instructions. Staff is recommending incorporating some of the best practices identified in Sandia's manual.

Some of the best practices identified in the other manuals include a responsibilities matrix for each procurement topic, and the way the sections in each chapter are organized. In addition, the way certain topics were covered such as evaluation factors, commercial competition techniques and property administration were considered a best practice during our review of the manuals.

Attachment A provides more details of the review of each agency's procurement manuals. The major topics of procurement were used to compare each manual against our manual. Staff identified best practices with the designation "BP" in the matrix.

Staff has made efforts over the years to improve its procurement manual and make this document user friendly. However, the outcome was a procurement manual that continued to cover and regulate the universe of policies, protocols, issues and questions that might arise in any given purchase. In addition, based upon the review of the above manuals and the impacts of the proposed State legislative changes, it would be too difficult to edit ours in its current format. Therefore staff is proposing to replace the manual with a new set of Board adopted policy. To do this, it is staff's intention to separate policy from guidelines and procedures in the new manual. The Board would still be responsible for approving changes to procurement policy, but authority to make changes to the guidelines, responsibilities and

process flowcharts that implement those policies would rest with the Executive Officer, Procurement and Material Management.

NEXT STEPS

Procurement staff along with County Counsel will draft the new Procurement Manual for Board approval.

ATTACHMENTS

- A. Matrix Comparing Procurement Manual

Prepared by: Bob Webb, Sr. Contract Administrator

Lorraine Mitchell
Lorraine Mitchell
Executive Officer, Procurement & Material
Management

Roger Snoble
Roger Snoble
Chief Executive Officer

ATTACHMENT A
COMPARISON OF PROCUREMENT MANUALS

	NJ Transit	MBTA	DART	WMATA	BART	LA County	Sandia
ges: ges: (BP):	139; 21; 7/03 Best Practice Most chapters contain policy, and then provide guidelines for implementing policy then responsibilities by dept. Organized on a chronological sequence of a normal procurement process.	164; 18; 11/02; have received only Material Mgt. Manual and professional services to date; contains solicitation and contract clauses; size of procurement manual not comparable to other agencies because not all procurement processes are covered.	328; 11; 6/96; 112 pages in the Manual are FAR based contract clauses; many similarities to FAR based documents <u>BP:</u> separate chapter on Organizational Conflicts of Interest	348; 26; 4/93, 3 editions; Authority compact (multi- government MOU) rewritten in 1996 due to changes in FAR; seems to be the model for other manuals (BART, MTA)	325, but 87 pages are blank and reserved; 10; 12/98; 5 revisions; <u>BP:</u> chronological listing of actions in major processes with responsible parties identified	60 pgs for purchasing, 249 pgs for construction; 48 pgs for purchasing, 28 pgs for construction;	not bound by FTA requirements, operates under prime contract from DOE; clearly written; model for federal based procurements after acquisition reform <u>BP:</u> chronological listing of actions in major processes with responsible parties identified.
							From Procurement Web Page: "Our mission is to partner with Sandians, stakeholders and suppliers to provide goods and services at the right time, for the

	NJ Transit	MBTA	DART	WMATA	BART	LA County	Sandia
ized ried	Discusses state law in 2 pages	NA	Reference to applicable sections of Texas Transportation Code	References Section 73 of the Authority Compact.	Laws briefly referenced	For purchasing, brief reference to PCC and County Code; construction references law throughout manual.	right price, following the right rules. This enables Sandia to strengthen its competitive advantage. We commit to do this in an atmosphere of trust and respect."
Cy ness	Concise, lists only policy - NJ also has special set aside program discussed in manual	High level statement of program goals	No separate chapter; encourages Joint Ventures to increase participation of minority and women owned business	Chapter mixes policy and procedure; specifies documents to be completed in bids; identifies how to request waivers	No separate chapter; identifies policy for program; references separate DBE Program on file in Office of Civil Rights	Separate chapters; describes Community Based Enterprise Program, Small Business Program, and Local Small Business Enterprise Preference Program	Operates under Prime Contract Subcontracting Plan

ion	<u>BP:</u> details on contracting officer and project manager responsibilities	Describes coordination requirements with user dept. in planning only	No discussion of procurement planning	Numerous topics including options, publicizing; and specifications; describes detailed planning method	Mixes BART process with FAR based procedures; <u>BP:</u> chronological listing of actions in major processes with responsible party identified	No discussion of procurement planning	5 chapters on acquisition planning;	
is	<u>BAR</u> ries	Describes planning process & identifies responsibilities	General policy on P-card with reference to detailed procedure; responsibilities in small purchase process, file contents	Special "Hotline" process for urgent requirements; does not cover P- card or small purchase policy	2 page simple process for contracts under \$25,000	No P-card procedures; FAR based description of Blanket Purchase Agreements and Imprest Funds; small purchase threshold set at \$100,000	Informal bidding up to \$100,000	<u>BP:</u> stresses cooperative nature of planning process
for	for m;	for	for	Fairly standard, straightforward process; subject is approx. 25% of manual;	FAR based, heavy on process; very similar to MTA manual in topics covered;	FAR based, heavy on process; very similar to MTA manual;	Not covered in manual, Procurement Card may be used to perform procurements up to \$25,000.	
led	g	g	led	major topics include: - general requirements, - IFB preparation - bid - bidder submissions, - bidding time, - bidders list, - general terms, conditions	major topics include: - scope - IFB preparation - bid - requirements, - public notice, - bidders lists, - pre-bid	Standard public agency bidding process;	Mentioned only briefly in construction chapter Very little coverage of sealed bidding because of type of work done by Sandia;	
				- bid prices, - price escalation - bid	- telegraphic bids, - bid samples,	- notification to vendors, - maintaining bid system integrity, - bid list		

	<p>affidavits and bonds have been filed with the bid.</p> <p>major topics include</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - anti boycott covenant, - f.o.b. point, - maximum delivery period, - work in harmony, - equal opportunity, - DBE, - collusion, - single bid, - buyer responsibility, - purchasing limits, - bid opening, - bidders list, - advertisements, - corrected bids, - options, - liquidated damages 	<p>security/performance bond,</p> <p>conferences,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - pre-opening bid modification/ withdrawal, - late bids, - withdrawals <p>opening bids,</p> <p>bid mistakes</p> <p>bid evaluation,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - low tie bids, - award, -- advertising <p>responsibility,</p> <p>cancellation of IFB,</p> <p>pre-qualification of firms for capital projects,</p> <p>bid opening,</p> <p>bid evaluation,</p> <p>filings.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - facsimile bids, - pre-bid conferences, - amendment/ cancellation of IFB, - modification/ withdrawal of bids, - late bids, - modifications, and withdrawals, - receipt and safeguarding of bids, - bid opening, - cancellation of IFB, - rejection of bids, - mistakes in bids - bid evaluation, - economic price adjustment, - resolving tie bids 	<p>and opening, evaluation of bids, award process, sealed bid procurement files, disposition of scrap and other disposable items, and two-step sealed bidding</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - advertising, bidding time, - pre-bid conference, - site visits, - responses to questions, - amendments to contract documents - late bids, - opening bids, - bid errors, - bid withdrawals, - rejection of low bid, - tie bids, - responsiveness of bids, - responsible bidder, - bid rejections - recom. for award, - award notification - notice to proceed 	<p>15 chapters on solicitation and evaluation/award, BP.</p> <p>Sections on Best Value Procurement, Commercial Competition Techniques,</p>
R	Similar to IFB chapter, includes A-E; includes guidelines for each step in RFP process; defines responsibilities for each step;	Basic process for acquiring material through negotiation.	Mixture of FAR based with DART specific requirements; describes procedures/processes for most steps of RFP; separate A-E chapter; special statutory	FAR based with BART specific requirements; describes procedures/processes for most steps of RFP; includes A-E section that covers CA specific requirements; describes	Brief discussion in purchasing manual and in consultant service contract section of construction manual; no discussion of selection of evaluation factors,	
es	major topics					

processes of A-E ; CA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - evaluation committee member certification, - procedure to determine award/negotiation . - review and approval, - advertisement, pre-proposal conference, - amendment of RFP, - cancellation of RFP, - receipt and safeguarding of proposals, - evaluation files, - conducting negotiations - separate discussion of A-E contracts 	<p>provision for acquisition of professional services for accountant, physician, and professional engineer;</p> <p><u>BP:</u></p>	<p>procedures/processes for most steps of RFP; separate A-E chapter; profit policy different from FTA guidelines;</p>	<p>major topics include</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - solicitation procedure, - evaluation criteria and weighting, - changes in District requirements, - RFP development - advertising, - format, - pre-proposal conference, - addenda, - source selection plan, - review of proposals, - composition of pre-solicitation notices and conferences, - pre-proposal conferences, - amendments to RFPs, - modification or withdrawal of proposals, - late proposals, - evaluation of proposals, - proposal discussions - mistakes in proposals, - award, <p>good section on evaluation factor language;</p> <p>major topics include</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - authority for use, - conditions for use, - determinations, - content of RFP, - proposal preparation time, - form of proposal, - advertising, - use of bidders list, - pre-proposal conferences, - amendments to RFPs, - modification or withdrawal of proposals, - late proposals, - evaluation of proposals, - proposal discussions - mistakes in proposals, - award, 	<p>best value procurements, proposal evaluation process or preparation for negotiations.</p> <p>Construction manual presents list of actions.</p> <p>Major topics include</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - best-value evaluation factors, oral presentations in lieu of written technical proposals, - solicitation communications, documentation, communication with offerors, - commercial competition techniques, - proposal evaluation, special situations in the evaluation of proposals, pre-negotiation planning, negotiations, postaward procedures, and documentation.
-----------------------	--	---	---	---	---

	- publicizing awards.	- unsolicited proposals, - source selection, - responsibilities, - evaluation factors, - changes in authority requirements, - competitive range, - discussion with offerors, - best and final offers, - price negotiation, - pre-negotiation objectives, - summary negotiation memorandum, - profit analysis factors, - notifications and debriefing.	- negotiation process, - best and final offers, - contract review	Based on Department of Energy requirements. Major topics include noncompetitive procurements and sole-source documentation requirements.
		Unique definition of sole source exceptions	Identifies state law exceptions to bidding, federal requirements & FAR based process for non-competitives	Discussion in construction manual includes circumstances permitting non-competitive procurement and processes for approval depending upon dollar amount.
2 to all & n-	5 pages covers policy, guidelines to implement & responsibilities only	NA	Identifies exceptions to bidding, federal requirements & FAR based process for non-competitives	Major topics include: - competitive

	bidding requirements under the California law, - exceptions to competitive bidding requirements under California law, - services agreements,	- form of agreement -contract provisions, - non-competitive emergency procurement procedures, - responsibilities for the non-competitive procurement of services	Identified Project Manager & Contract Administrator responsibilities; delineates contract change, task order, termination, and close out processes	Six chapters based on current best practices in government procurement;
y	Chapter includes contract formation, changes, payments, disputes and closeout	Includes many FAR based requirements; covered under several different chapters; <u>BP:</u> section on property administration	Identified Project Manager & Contract Administrator responsibilities; delineates contract change, task order, termination, and close out processes	<u>BP:</u> separate chapters on Organizational Conflicts of Interest, Assignment and

			monitoring; and contract files and file integrity. <u>BP:</u> Formal performance monitoring system.	Change of Name agreements, and on Acquisition Conflict Resolution
Covers 6 different contract types; act provides guidelines on when to use	Only firm fixed price	Covers 12 different contract types; detailed discussion & procedures	Covers 12 different contract types; firm fixed price, fixed price with escalation, cost sharing, cost plus fixed fee, time and materials/labor hour, and letter of intent.	Covers 6 different types in construction manual; fixed price/lump sum, fixed price indefinite quantity (based on unit prices), job order contract, cost plus fixed fee, time and materials, and design/build.
12 pages	NA	4 pages	17 pages	11 pages

Included in front of each chapter

Covers 10 difference contract types

11 pages

Covers 6 different types in construction manual

17 pages

25 pages in construction manual