

Thursday, May 24, 2007 9:00 A.M.

MINUTES

Los Angeles County
Metropolitan Transportation Authority

SPECIAL BOARD MEETING PROPOSED FARE RESTRUCTURING

One Gateway Plaza
3rd Floor Boardroom

Called to Order at 9:15 a.m.

Directors Present:

Gloria Molina, Chair
Pam O'Connor, 1st Vice Chair
Antonio Villaraigosa, 2nd Vice Chair
Lee Alpert
Mike Antonovich
Yvonne B. Burke
John Fasana
Richard Katz
Don Knabe
Bonnie Lowenthal
Ara J. Najarian
Bernard Parks
Zev Yaroslavsky
Doug Failing, non-voting member

Officers

Roger Snoble, Chief Executive Officer
Michele Jackson, Board Secretary
Karen Gorman, Ethics Officer
William Waters, Inspector General
County Counsel, General Counsel



Metropolitan Transportation Authority

Metro

1. CONSIDERED proposed **Fare Policy and Fare Restructuring Plan**.
 - A. RECEIVED Chair's Remarks.
 - B. HELD Public Hearing.
 - C. NO ACTION TAKEN TO ADOPT:
 1. resolution in accordance with California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) finding that the purpose of the Fare Restructuring Plan is to pay operating expenses;
 2. the proposed **Fare Policy**; and
 3. **Fare Restructuring Plan**.

FAILED - **Villaraigosa Substitute Motion** that the MTA Board of Directors:

1. adopt fare policy and principles (refer to Attachment A-1) to guide the development of the MTA's annual budget and long-term financial planning in lieu of the CEO proposal (recommendation C.2);
2. approve in concept that the MTA's projected five-year operating deficit will be solved through a combination of cost reductions, debt financing, and new revenue (refer to Attachment A-2);
3. adopt a 5% annual increase in all MTA fares effective July 1st of each fiscal year, beginning on July 1, 2007 (fiscal year 2008) in lieu of the fare modifications proposed by the CEO (recommendation C.3); for the purposes of simplifying fares, rates may be rounded each year for implementation; (Continued on next page)

(Continued from previous page)

4. adopt a \$0.25 off-peak cash fare (with unlimited free transfers and no zone charges) for seniors (age 65 or older), disabled, and Medicare customers during all days and hours of service except Monday through Friday (excluding holidays):

7 a.m. to 9 a.m. (morning peak)
4 p.m. to 7 p.m. (evening peak)
5. direct the CEO to report back to the MTA Board with recommended debt financing, service restructuring, service frequency adjustments, and other solutions necessary to balance the FY 2007-2008 budget as well as a balanced five-year operating budget consistent with principles adopted by the MTA Board.

APPROVED BY A 2/3 VOTE OF THE BOARD AS AMENDED:

Molina, Fasana, O'Connor and Yaroslavsky Motion that the Board of Directors:

1. adopt the fare schedule (see Attachment B) for fiscal years 2008 through 2012;
2. authorize the implementation of the first phase of fare restructuring in 2008 and the second phase in 2010 as outlined in the fare schedule (see Attachment B);
3. implement a 25 cent off-peak fare for disabled and seniors 65 years and older. The fare shall be valid between the hours of 9:00 a.m. and 3:00 p.m. and after 7:00 p.m. on all weekdays and all day Saturday, Sunday and Federal holidays. The only proof of eligibility required for seniors shall be a Medicare card;
4. direct the CEO to work with City of Los Angeles to implement the restructuring of downtown bus service and bus only peak-hour lanes as identified by the Mayor of Los Angeles in his letter to the Board dated May 21, 2007;
(Continued on next page)

(Continued from previous page)

5. instruct Metro's legislative advocates to aggressively pursue Metro's share of the 2007 State spillover funds estimated to be up to \$110 million;
6. instruct Metro's legislative advocates to lobby for the reauthorization of the CNG tax credits scheduled to sunset in 2009;
7. direct the CEO to prepare a comprehensive plan for checking fares on the Orange Line and all rail lines and report back to the Board within 60 days with an implementation plan that can begin within 60 days thereafter;
8. direct the CEO to perform an analysis of the 25 worst performing bus lines and report back to the Board within 90 days for review. The analysis should contain an assessment of how the lines could be restructured or consolidated in order to improve their performance and make them more cost effective;
9. direct the CEO to come back to the Board within two years with:
 1. an analysis of TAP data and possible future alternative fare structures including distance-based fares, peak and off-peak fares, and premium fares for train and express service;
 2. status of the cost savings from the restructuring of downtown service and the implementation of bus only lanes in partnership with the City of Los Angeles; and
10. direct the CEO to report to the Board quarterly on the ridership and revenue outcomes due to fare restructuring.

(See next page for Amendment)

Lowenthal Amendment : In order to ensure that the most economically vulnerable transit dependent users are not harmed by the proposed fare increase, I would like to amend the motion to include the following:

1. Budget an additional "safety net" of \$5 million through a Countywide expansion of the Immediate Needs program or a similar program targeting social service agencies that work with the neediest segment of the population.
2. Staff shall report back on the program that is developed and funding issues within six months to ensure effectiveness and the adequate level of funding.

ADOPTED resolution in accordance with California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) finding that the purpose of the fare restructuring plan is to pay operating expenses.

Villaraigosa Amendment that the MTA Board reduce the fiscal year 2007-2008 and any subsequent fare increase approved today by an amount equal to any state spillover funds received.

RECEIVED NO SECOND.

The Board DIRECTED the CEO to report back on amount of spillover funds received.

RECEIVED public comment.

Prepared by: Michele Chau
Board Specialist


Michele Jackson, Metro Board Secretary

ATTACHMENT A-1

Budget & Financial Planning Principles/Fare Policy

1. MTA should seek to maintain a low fare structure to maintain affordability for low income and transit dependent customers
2. MTA should commit to maintaining a first class bus system, a first class rail system, and a first class highway system
3. MTA should make modest fare adjustments annually to account for rising operating costs (labor, fuel, etc.) and to minimize the overall impact of fare changes in any given fiscal year
4. MTA should pursue creative efficiencies and service restructuring, including partnering with jurisdictions where MTA operates service, to reduce operating costs
5. MTA should continue to expand its fixed guideway system (rail and busway) to increase higher speed options for the transit dependent and provide viable alternatives to driving

ATTACHMENT A-2

Operating Deficit Solutions

Cost reductions

- Restructure downtown bus transit to reduce service duplication
- Implement bus lanes and transit priority signal system on city arterials to increase bus speed and reduce number of buses required to provide the same capacity and service frequency
- Slightly reduce rail service frequency, with 1-2 minutes increased wait time during weekday peak and 3-5 minutes increased wait time during weekday off-peak and weekends

Capital program debt financing

- Debt finance Proposition C 40% Discretionary and/or Transit Development Account (TDA) portions of planned bus and rail capital expenditures based on useful life of asset (e.g. 12 years for buses, 25 years for rail cars, and 30 years for facilities) starting in FY 2009

New revenue

- Secure 100% of state spillover funds for FY 2008 that should flow to LA County, with MTA share being \$110 million
- Program \$46 million in federal CNG tax credits that expire September 2009 for FY 2008 through FY 2010
- 5% annual fare increase to cover rising operating costs (labor, fuel, etc.)

ATTACHMENT B

	A	B	R	T	V
1					
2					
3					
4		Current	FY08	FY10	FY12
5	Cash	\$1.25	\$1.25	\$1.50	\$1.80
6	Day	\$3.00	\$5.00	\$6.00	\$7.25
7	Week	\$14.00	\$17.00	\$20.00	\$24.00
8	Month	\$52.00	\$62.00	\$75.00	\$90.00
9	EZ Pass	\$58.00	\$70.00	\$84.00	\$100.00
10					
11	Sr Cash	\$0.45	\$0.55	\$0.65	\$0.75
12	Sr Day	\$1.50	\$1.80	\$2.15	\$2.55
13	Sr Cash/Off peak		\$0.25	\$0.30	\$0.35
14	Sr Month	\$12.00	\$14.00	\$17.00	\$21.00
15	Sr EZ	\$29.00	\$35.00	\$42.00	\$50.00
16	K-12	\$20.00	\$24.00	\$29.00	\$35.00
17	College	\$30.00	\$36.00	\$43.00	\$52.00
18					
19	Token	\$1.10	\$1.25	\$1.50	\$1.80
20	Night/Owl/Off peak	\$0.75	\$1.25	\$1.50	\$1.80
21	Reg Cash Ea Zone	\$0.50	\$0.60	\$0.70	\$0.85
22	Reg/EZ Monthly Ea Zone	\$15.00	\$18.00	\$22.00	\$26.00
23	Metro-Muni	\$0.25	\$0.30	\$0.35	\$0.40
24	Sr Cash Ea Zone	\$0.25	\$0.30	\$0.35	\$0.40
25	Sr/EZ Monthly Ea Zone	\$7.50	\$9.50	\$9.50	\$9.50
26	Sr Metro-Muni	\$0.10	\$0.10	\$0.10	\$0.15
27	Semi Month	\$27.00	Eliminate	Eliminate	Eliminate
28					
46	Fare/Brd	\$0.60	\$0.71	\$0.80	\$0.87



Los Angeles County
Metropolitan Transportation Authority

Metro

RECAP OF PROCEEDINGS

LOS ANGELES COUNTY METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY SPECIAL BOARD MEETING THURSDAY, MAY 24, 2007

		DIRECTORS VOTING													
ATTENDANCE		P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	
ITEM NO.	SUBJECT ITEM	ANTONOVICH	LOWENTHAL	FASANA	ALPERT	BURKE	VILLARIGOSA	MOLINA (CHAIR)	O'CONNOR	YAROSLAVSKY	KATZ	KNABE	PARKS	NAJARIAN	FAILING
	ACTION TAKEN														
1A	CHAIR'S REMARKS	A	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	
1B	PUBLIC HEARING	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	

		DIRECTORS VOTING														
ATTENDANCE			P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	
ITEM NO.	SUBJECT ITEM	ACTION TAKEN	ANTONOVICH	LOWENTHAL	FASANA	ALPERT	BURKE	VILLARIGOSA	MOLINA (CHAIR)	O'CONNOR	YAROSLAVSKY	KATZ	KNABE	PARKS	NAJARIAN	FAILING
1C	ADOPT: 1. RESOLUTION IN ACCORDANCE WITH CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT (CEQA) FINDING THAT THE PURPOSE OF THE FARE RESTRUCTURING PLAN IS TO PAY OPERATING EXPENSES; 2. THE PROPOSED FARE POLICY; AND 3. FARE RESTRUCTURING PLAN. (REQUIRES 2/3 VOTE OF THE BOARD)	NO ACTION TAKEN														

		DIRECTORS VOTING														
ATTENDANCE			P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P		
ITEM NO.	SUBJECT ITEM	ACTION TAKEN	ANTONOVICH	LOWENTHAL	FASANA	ALPERT	BURKE	VILLARIGOSA	MOLINA (CHAIR)	O'CONNOR	YAROSLAVSKY	KATZ	KNABE	PARKS	NAJARIAN	FAILING
1C	<p>VILLARIGOSA SUBSTITUTE MOTION THAT THE MTA BOARD OF DIRECTORS:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> ADOPT THE ATTACHED FARE POLICY AND PRINCIPLES TO GUIDE THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE MTA'S ANNUAL BUDGET AND LONG-TERM FINANCIAL PLANNING IN LIEU OF THE CEO PROPOSAL (RECOMMENDATION C.2); APPROVE IN CONCEPT THAT THE MTA'S PROJECTED FIVE-YEAR OPERATING DEFICIT WILL BE SOLVED THROUGH A COMBINATION OF COST REDUCTIONS, DEBT FINANCING, AND NEW REVENUE (ATTACHED); ADOPT A 5% ANNUAL INCREASE IN ALL MTA FARES EFFECTIVE JULY 1ST OF EACH FISCAL YEAR, BEGINNING ON JULY 1, 2007 (FISCAL YEAR 2008) IN LIEU OF THE FARE MODIFICATIONS PROPOSED BY THE CEO (RECOMMENDATION C.3); FOR THE PURPOSES OF SIMPLIFYING FARES, RATES MAY BE ROUNDED EACH YEAR FOR IMPLEMENTATION; (REQUIRES 2/3 VOTE OF THE BOARD) 	<p>FAILED</p>	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	N	N	Y	N	Y	N	

		DIRECTORS VOTING															
ATTENDANCE			P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P		
ITEM NO.	SUBJECT ITEM	ACTION TAKEN	ANTONOVICH	LOWENTHAL	FASANA	ALPERT	BURKE	VILLARAIGOSA	MOLINA (CHAIR)	O'CONNOR	YAROSLAVSKY	KATZ	KNABE	PARKS	NAJARIAN	FAILING	
1C	<p>4. ADOPT A \$0.25 OFF-PEAK CASH FARE (WITH UNLIMITED FREE TRANSFERS AND NO ZONE CHARGES) FOR SENIORS (AGE 65 OR OLDER), DISABLED, AND MEDICARE CUSTOMERS DURING ALL DAYS AND HOURS OF SERVICE EXCEPT MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY (EXCLUDING HOLIDAYS);</p> <p>7 A.M. TO 9 A.M. (MORNING PEAK) 4 P.M. TO 7 P.M. (EVENING PEAK)</p> <p>5. DIRECT THE CEO TO REPORT BACK TO THE MTA BOARD WITH RECOMMENDED DEBT FINANCING, SERVICE RESTRUCTURING, SERVICE FREQUENCY ADJUSTMENTS, AND OTHER SOLUTIONS NECESSARY TO BALANCE THE FY 2007-2008 BUDGET AS WELL AS A BALANCED FIVE-YEAR OPERATING BUDGET CONSISTENT WITH PRINCIPLES ADOPTED BY THE MTA BOARD.</p>																

		DIRECTORS VOTING														
ATTENDANCE			P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	
ITEM NO.	SUBJECT ITEM	ACTION TAKEN	ANTONOVICH	LOWENTHAL	FASANA	ALPERT	BURKE	VILLARIGOSA	MOLINA (CHAIR)	O'CONNOR	YAROSLAVSKY	KATZ	KNABE	PARKS	NAJARIAN	FAILING
1C	<p>MOLINA, FASANA, O'CONNOR AND YAROSLAVSKY MOTION THAT THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS:</p> <p>1. ADOPT THE ATTACHED FARE SCHEDULE FOR FISCAL YEARS 2008 THROUGH 2012;</p> <p>2. AUTHORIZE THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE FIRST PHASE OF FARE RESTRUCTURING IN 2008 AND THE SECOND PHASE IN 2010 AS OUTLINED IN THE ATTACHED FARE SCHEDULE;</p> <p>3. IMPLEMENT A 25 CENT OFF-PEAK FARE FOR DISABLED AND SENIORS 65 YEARS AND OLDER. THE FARE SHALL BE VALID BETWEEN THE HOURS OF 9:00 A.M. AND 3:00 P.M AND AFTER 7:00 P.M. ON ALL WEEKDAYS AND ALL DAY SATURDAY, SUNDAY AND FEDERAL HOLIDAYS. THE ONLY PROOF OF ELIGIBILITY REQUIRED FOR SENIORS SHALL BE A MEDICARE CARD;</p>	<p>APPROVED BY A 2/3 VOTE OF THE BOARD AS AMENDED BY LOWENTHAL, AND ADOPTED RESOLUTION IN ACCORDANCE WITH CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT (CEQA) FINDING THAT THE PURPOSE OF THE FARE RESTRUCTURING PLAN IS TO PAY OPERATING EXPENSES</p>	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N		

		DIRECTORS VOTING														
ATTENDANCE			P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	
ITEM NO.	SUBJECT ITEM	ACTION TAKEN	ANTONOVICH	LOWENTHAL	FASANA	ALPERT	BURKE	VILLARAIGOSA	MOLINA (CHAIR)	O'CONNOR	YAROSLAVSKY	KATZ	KNABE	PARKS	NAJARIAN	FAILING
1C	<p>4. DIRECT THE CEO TO WORK WITH CITY OF LOS ANGELES TO IMPLEMENT THE RESTRUCTURING OF DOWNTOWN BUS SERVICE AND BUS ONLY PEAK-HOUR LANES AS IDENTIFIED BY THE MAYOR OF LOS ANGELES IN HIS LETTER TO THE BOARD DATED MAY 21, 2007;</p> <p>5. INSTRUCT METRO'S LEGISLATIVE ADVOCATES TO AGGRESSIVELY PURSUE METRO'S SHARE OF THE 2007 STATE SPILLOVER FUNDS ESTIMATED TO BE UP TO \$110 MILLION;</p> <p>6. INSTRUCT METRO'S LEGISLATIVE ADVOCATES TO LOBBY FOR THE REAUTHORIZATION OF THE CNG TAX CREDITS SCHEDULED TO SUNSET IN 2009;</p>															

		DIRECTORS VOTING														
ATTENDANCE			P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	
ITEM NO.	SUBJECT ITEM	ACTION TAKEN	ANTONOVICH	LOWENTHAL	FASANA	ALPERT	BURKE	VILLARAIGOSA	MOLINA (CHAIR)	O'CONNOR	YAROSLAVSKY	KATZ	KNABE	PARKS	NAJARIAN	FAILING
1C	<p>7. DIRECT THE CEO TO PREPARE A COMPREHENSIVE PLAN FOR CHECKING FARES ON THE ORANGE LINE AND ALL RAIL LINES AND REPORT BACK TO THE BOARD WITHIN 60 DAYS WITH AN IMPLEMENTATION PLAN THAT CAN BEGIN WITHIN 60 DAYS THEREAFTER;</p> <p>8. DIRECT THE CEO TO PERFORM AN ANALYSIS OF THE 25 WORST PERFORMING BUS LINES AND REPORT BACK TO THE BOARD WITHIN 90 DAYS FOR REVIEW. THE ANALYSIS SHOULD CONTAIN AN ASSESSMENT OF HOW THE LINES COULD BE RESTRUCTURED OR CONSOLIDATED IN ORDER TO IMPROVE THEIR PERFORMANCE AND MAKE THEM MORE COST EFFECTIVE;</p>															

		DIRECTORS VOTING														
ATTENDANCE			P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	
ITEM NO.	SUBJECT ITEM	ACTION TAKEN	ANTONOVICH	LOWENTHAL	FASANA	ALPERT	BURKE	VILLARAIGOSA	MOLINA (CHAIR)	O'CONNOR	YAROSLAVSKY	KATZ	KNABE	PARKS	NAJARIAN	FAILING
1C	<p>9. DIRECT THE CEO TO COME BACK TO THE BOARD WITHIN TWO YEARS WITH:</p> <p>A. AN ANALYSIS OF TAP DATA AND POSSIBLE FUTURE ALTERNATIVE FARE STRUCTURES INCLUDING DISTANCE-BASED FARES, PEAK AND OFF-PEAK FARES, AND PREMIUM FARES FOR TRAIN AND EXPRESS SERVICE;</p> <p>B. STATUS OF THE COST SAVINGS FROM THE RESTRUCTURING OF DOWNTOWN SERVICE AND THE IMPLEMENTATION OF BUS ONLY LANES IN PARTNERSHIP WITH THE CITY OF LOS ANGELES; AND</p> <p>10. DIRECT THE CEO TO REPORT TO THE BOARD QUARTERLY ON THE RIDERSHIP AND REVENUE OUTCOMES DUE TO FARE RESTRUCTURING.</p>															

		DIRECTORS VOTING														
ATTENDANCE			P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P		
ITEM NO.	SUBJECT ITEM	ACTION TAKEN	ANTONOVICH	LOWENTHAL	FASANA	ALPERT	BURKE	VILLARAIGOSA	MOLINA (CHAIR)	O'CONNOR	YAROSLAVSKY	KATZ	KNABE	PARKS	NAJARIAN	FAILING
1C	<p>LOWENTHAL AMENDMENT:</p> <p>IN ORDER TO ENSURE THAT THE MOST ECONOMICALLY VULNERABLE TRANSIT DEPENDENT USERS ARE NOT HARMED BY THE PROPOSED FARE INCREASE, I WOULD LIKE TO AMEND THE MOTION TO INCLUDE THE FOLLOWING:</p> <p>1. BUDGET AN ADDITIONAL "SAFETY NET" OF \$5 MILLION THROUGH A COUNTYWIDE EXPANSION OF THE IMMEDIATE NEEDS PROGRAM OR A SIMILAR PROGRAM TARGETING SOCIAL SERVICE AGENCIES THAT WORK WITH THE NEEDIEST SEGMENT OF THE POPULATION.</p> <p>2. STAFF SHALL REPORT BACK ON THE PROGRAM THAT IS DEVELOPED AND FUNDING ISSUES WITHIN SIX MONTHS TO ENSURE EFFECTIVENESS AND THE ADEQUATE LEVEL OF FUNDING.</p>	APPROVED	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y	
1C	VILLARAIGOSA AMENDMENT TO REDUCE THE FISCAL YEAR 2007-2008 AND ANY SUBSEQUENT FARE INCREASE APPROVED TODAY BY AN AMOUNT EQUAL TO ANY STATE SPILLOVER FUNDS RECEIVED	RECEIVED NO SECOND. DIRECTED CEO TO REPORT BACK ON AMOUNT OF SPILLOVER FUNDS RECEIVED														

